



**OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL**

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

**RE: Noticed Meeting with CM Carlucci and CM Boylan RE 2022-232**

Wednesday, June 8, 2022  
12:00 P.M.

**Location:** Lynwood Roberts Room

**Attendees:**

CM Matt Carlucci	Chester Aikens II	John Nooney	Sheri Webber
CM Michael Boylan	Amber Lehman	Debi Pataky	
Sonia Johnson	Phillip Peterson	Dr. Alan Bliss	

**Video Link:** <https://jaxcityc.granicus.com/player/clip/4272>

**Meeting Convened:** 12:02 PM

CM CARLUCCI

Thank you so much for coming. Appreciate it, everybody, for coming. I wish we had more Council members, but I'm glad that those who had an interest sent their Council ECAs. So, I welcome everybody. We've done the table introductions. Now, opening remarks.

This bill is very important to me. This is an issue that has been very important to me, and I knew that it would become a Council issue back before my election, going back in 2018. And I have learned over time and experience that, if you know difficult issues will land in your lap, it's best to search your soul and figure out where you will come down, so that you can be comfortable in your skin as you address it, even if you have to cross a "line" to do that.

Our city is a great city, but we're also a city that's very diverse. And it's not just black and white. It's Hispanic, it's Bosnian, etc. We have a real melting pot that has come together in Jacksonville particularly I think over last 15 years, 20 years perhaps. But this is one that's important to me because of my own personal journey that you may have read about in the paper when I talked about my journey with race, and I think we all have our own journeys, so I'm not the only one with a journey. I get that. But I could go on and on about my journey.

And so, I decided to start working on this bill in January, right after we withdrew Mayor Curry's bill. And we also put together, what I thought, was a fabulous community conversation piece to that, and I submitted that to the Council President. I also submitted, prior to the Council President, I think, to the Civic Council to give them a heads up, and that was probably back in January or so. Do you have that time frame?



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

WEBBER

I don't remember the exact timeframe. I do know that you sent the community conversation format to Council President Newby in March about the same time that the bill was filed.

CM CARLUCCI

Our bill was the first to be filed, and our community conversation was probably one of the first to be entered. The other was from Ben Frazier. He submitted a community conversation. So, I sent a copy of my support of [removing] Confederate Monuments, I think back in October, to everybody on the Council, and to the media. Just trying to, you know, tell people now. Sometimes with tough issues, the quicker you tell people where you stand, it's like pulling a Band-Aid off quicker.

I have put my mind, my soul, and my heart into this bill. And every time I try to bring it up, you know, somebody's got an objection, and that's okay. But I kind of feel like I'm getting thrown so many objections I can't really get to why I think this bill is worth support. And one objection was that the Northside Coalition had a whole list and host of other markers and monuments they wanted to look at, including the one in the cemetery. So, I asked Ben Frazier if he would clarify that, and he did, and he sent everybody on the Council an email stating that it was the Tribute to the Women of the Confederacy and what was left in James Weldon Johnson Park, [gesturing] whichever way that is from here. The one in the cemetery, they were not concerned with, and I'm not concerned with that one because I just think that's a little too sacred for me to go in and start trying to disturb.

I hope you don't mind, but you're the only folks I got to talk to. So, I want to explain to you why I'm doing this. Just wish my good friend, Tommy Hazouri, was here and I'd have a good strong voice to help me. So, we put the bill together. And I don't think he would mind me saying this... I'm not saying that he endorsed this bill, or he did not endorse this bill. But we went to the JU Public Policy [Institute], and we had Rick Mullaney weigh in on this bill, with Sheri and the General Counsel.

Now, somebody else said, well, it should have been done by ordinance, the resolution is meaningless. And did we get a letter from Jason Teal on that?

WEBBER

Yes, sir. So, that memo should be in the packet.

CM CARLUCCI

Would you please read that?

WEBBER



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

Yes, sir.

CM CARLUCCI

Because the General Counsel is the one who told us to put it in resolution form. Go ahead, Sheri.

WEBBER

Okay, from Jason Teal, General Counsel. Subject: 2022 232 Legislation. Date: June 7, 2022.

Pursuant to our telephone conference after the discussion occurring at the Rules Committee meeting on June 7, 2022, you requested a memorandum regarding the appropriateness of your legislation -232 being filed as a resolution versus as an ordinance. The definition of resolution and ordinance are specified in City Council Rule 3.101, Manner of Legislation. In that rule, an ordinance is an efficient legislative action with a Council which action is a regulation of a general and permanent nature and enforceable as a local law. In addition to other actions required to be done by ordinance, appropriations shall be made, penalties shall be imposed taxes, fees, and other charges shall be levied more established, mandatory duties and obligations shall be created, and all contracts and agreements requiring Council approval shall be approved only by ordinance provided however, that economic development investment incentives and related contracts, agreements and appropriations incorporated as exhibits there too, shall be approved by resolution. an ordinance shall be amended waived or repealed only by ordinance.

Additionally, a resolution means an expression of the Council concerning matters of city administration, an expression of a temporary advisory or absorptive character, a provision for the disposition of a particular item of the administrative business of the council, or an approval of economic development, investment incentives, and related contracts, agreements, and appropriations incorporated as exhibits there to. Appointments shall be made or confirmed by resolution.

Whether a bill should be filed as a resolution versus an ordinance depends on its purpose. The purposes of Resolution -232, as stated in the bill itself, are (1) to express a sentiment that the Council is determined to "move Jacksonville forward by considering the adverse impact of statuary and monuments erected post-Civil War, that expressed glorification of the Confederacy and its causes, or were erected during the Jim Crow era and the impact on our citizens"; (2) to request that the Mayor, his administration, and the Council produce a revised plan and timeline to remove statuary and monuments from public property and park spaces; (3) to express a commitment to appropriate funding to cover the costs of the removal; and (4) establish a due date for the Mayor's, his administration's, and the Council's plan to fund and remove statuary and monuments to be on or before July 26, 2022. These purposes of resolution -232 concern matters of City Administration and are requesting an expression of an advisory



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

character and therefore most appropriately aligned with the definition of a resolution as opposed to an ordinance. As such, this bill was appropriately filed as a resolution.

CM CARLUCCI

Thank you. So, we did the right thing, and when I say that I put my mind body and soul into this, that's a lot. To try and make sure I had all my I's dotted and my T's crossed. We introduced this bill before any other the bill. We introduced a format of a public conversation before any other conversations were introduced. I then sent that information to the Civic Council. They never contacted me back, and they opted to go a different direction without conversation with me. But at the end of the day with all the minutiae, and all the "resolution or ordinance" or "is it this or is it that" or Dachau in Germany. Listen, I understand that everybody's got their own internal feelings about this. But I can tell you one thing that is a maxim that I carry in my back pocket, and I have for many, many years, and that is that Jacksonville moves best when we move together, but we have a substantial citizenry here that sees and knows of these monuments, and they hurt. They bring pain. They bring reminders of historical oppression in their communities and their families. And they feel those should be gone. These monuments were put in at the time of Jim Crow. If I'm not mistaken, they were put up, the Women of the Southern Confederacy, was put up at the height of Jacksonville's lynching of Black people, is that correct? In that era?

WEBBER

It was installed in 1915, and I'm sure that Dr. Bliss can speak more to that as to the other events that were associated. And lynching did continue throughout that time. I don't know if that's at the height or not, but I do know that there was a significant rise starting from that point forward, yeah.

CM CARLUCCI

So, in that timeframe. I have spoken—since 2018, when I was thinking of running for Council, and knowing that this was going to come up—to white people and Black and everybody in between. And what they have told me—mostly on the part of white folks—is it doesn't really make that big of a difference to me. They don't really pay attention to them. But then when I talk to so many Black people that I know, and that I don't know, white collar, blue collar, at the store or wherever, and I ask them, "Do you still feel the effects of race today? Do you still feel the effects of race? And 90%, at least, will tell you... one person actually kind of laughed like, are you kidding? You know, are you kidding? I said, "No, I'm just trying to ask you." They say, every day, sometimes in very small ways, but sometimes in very big ways. And then knowing our city still has Confederate monuments, "Do we want them torn down? Yeah, we'd like it, but we don't know if it'll ever be done in Jacksonville, Florida."

We are on the cusp of the Bicentennial. So, I introduced my bill and I deferred it, and I deferred it, and I deferred it. I can't keep deferring this bill until three months from now, until the Fall, or to the end of



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

the year. So, a lot of people that are counting on my bill to pass and they want it to pass, and their voices have been unheard because they don't want to come up the City Council because of the toxic environment. I don't think I need to point out who or where or even on both sides but it's not a good environment. And a lot of that spills over into my emails. Like one I got this morning—I'm a disgusting person. I am somebody who should resign from City Council and resign from Jacksonville. Now, how am I supposed to resign from Jacksonville? Besides putting a "for sale" sign up. Or "I wish you would die."

But I'm used to this because I have a trail of endorsing Black people like Nat Glover and having my office sign with racial slurs painted on it. And I have those pictures in here [holds up phone] for anybody that would care to look. To endorsing Alvin Brown and to helping Warren Jones become the first Council President serve a full term and then a second term, and for sticking up for Ray Alfred in the middle of a mayoral campaign. And I can tell you, the list can go on and on and on. Because it stems from an original conversation that I had with Alton Yates in 1987, where he told me how it was not a level playing field. And I listened to him for almost two hours in my little 10 ft by 7 ft office in the Old City Hall. And so, all the way fast forward to now< I feel like maybe I can make the change in the environment and the culture of Jacksonville.

And by the way, if we want to think about this as an economic development tool, this is not an economic development tool. These monuments are not economic development tools. Because, as my good friend Bob Rhodes will tell you and other people that will tell you, is that companies, before they come to a city, they research what the culture is like. They see these types of things that don't happen. And they want to take their very diverse group of employees to a place that seems to be more welcoming. So, location plays a big factor to where companies move to, and the culture of that.

I apologize for taking this much time, but it's seldom that I get a chance to speak from my heart and people actually listen. And I'm I am as serious as I can be. And other than, I guess, the time we put into getting a resiliency officer in Jacksonville, this probably has taken more time and more thought and more soul searching and more courage and more stepping over the line. The line of statesmanship, not just being a politician, and there's a big damn difference. So, I believe it is time, actually long overdue. As of tomorrow, it'll be two years since we made promises, we made speeches in March, we stood with the mayor, and all those monuments were coming in. Two years later tomorrow, we still have one and a half left. And somebody's got to speak up about it. And that just happens to be me and trying to get people to talk to me about it, and I'm not talking just about Council members, really. I'm talking about just other people. It's like they're scared. You don't talk about it.

But these monuments were put up as a way to send a message to an intended audience. They were not put up, in my view and from all the history I've read, to say that we're honoring general so and so



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

because the Civil War was 50 years over. They were messages in marble and granite and in bronze. That's what they do and that's what they are still today, 200 years later, and with Juneteenth just around the corner. I've gone on, I apologize. But I kinda don't apologize. I gotta get it out. And you can't do that in three minutes. And that's why I appreciate everybody being here. Michael, I'm gonna turn it over to you, sir. Because you've have opening remarks and if you take 45 minutes and we'll all be in deep. I want to make sure we have time for 15 I forgot who's halfway to

CM BOYLAN

Thank you. I really do appreciate your passion. Appreciate your strength and courage to put this forward, but I have to respectfully agree to disagree in context of the rationale for this bill. But like you, I'd like to take a minute and kind of walk you through my journey, so you'll understand where I come from in the context of this process.

Most of you probably know, I moved to Jacksonville in May of 1999, from Miami. And I quickly learned the adage the further north you go the further south you are, and I found that to be the case. Here I was a white male running the public media station downtown. I thought that I had a responsibility to help bridge the culture and improve the culture of our community. Sometime thereafter, I found the Human Rights Commission's program called the Study Circles. These are 10-hour sessions, small group sessions, with a workbook that was put together as a study guide to help a group come together black and white to understand what it's like to walk in each other's shoes. As part of that process, we talked about the history of race in Jacksonville. We talked to him about structural racism. We talked about colorism. We talked about racial profiling. We did talk about white privilege, and a white privilege exercise that we used to understand how each of those... where we had opportunities that just were not available to other folks, and to your point, a lot of folks still feel that way. I have no doubt about it.

I went on to facilitate, probably over the course of eight to 10 years. And over 2001 to about 2012, no less than 20, or more like 25, of these 10-hour sessions. In fact, I've got a little glass statue in my office from The Human Rights Commission that says "BFF" or Best Facilitator Forever because I did that process. I share that because I understand and appreciate, and I have to say I learned from each and every one of those sessions. But I also have to tell you that in not a single session was the word "monuments" or "statue" ever raised. I know that to be a fact because I had never heard of The Women of the Confederacy statue until we had this conversation back in the fall. There are concerns about the present, about the relationship and economic mobility, you know, their positioning, they could—I don't know if they care and care less about the statutes. But it was not a point of conversation. So, I don't know if the broad reach of the community feels as strongly as some are portraying them to feel.



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

Secondly, history, the importance of history... during my tenure as president of WJCT, we produced the Ax Handle Saturday documentary, a 60-minute documentary that showed the warts of what happened. The mistreatment, the maltreatment, of Blacks, of men of color, and women of color in our community. But more importantly, it talked about the misuse and use of the police in that process, the media in that process, and the community as a whole. My great fear in putting these statues under the bushel basket: it eliminates for us the opportunity to learn from them. And that is kind of why I feel it's really important for us. I know the word context had been used the other day, but I think context is important. The very fact that we're having these kind of conversations around these issues is because the statute still stands and if we take them down lightly, those conversations won't continue for our children or our grandchildren in that process.

So, we've seen two different groups approach this: Anna Brosche and Dr. Bliss is here. He was part of that group. He was then part of the working group that the mayor put together two years ago. If you take a look at the work of those two groups... and Alan and I talked briefly last night. He can speak to that more specifically, but I do want to quote specifically from the report that they provided us last year. Conversely, and I quote, "We believe the City of Jacksonville **should not** spend any public money to subsidize the removal or transfer of Confederate monuments to private ownership. Secondly, to surrender control the monuments to private groups for removal or reuse."

I use that as a foundation for not supporting the original bill. I'm using that as a foundation for not supporting the second bill.

CM CARLUCCI  
When was the second?

CM BOYLAN  
The first one was a year ago, with the Mayor [2021-752].

CM CARLUCCI  
Oh, I'm sorry.

CM BOYLAN  
Yeah. His was a bill and yours is a resolution. So, be that as it may, the point was that I use as that as the foundation for my decision. And then put on top of that the strategic plan, which you supported, that said that we should do this, to your words, together. And we need to work together on this process, and so, getting out in front with this bill is not something that I can be comfortable with. So, I firmly believe that in the context of moving this forward with the community conversations, that I'm hopeful that



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

they're going to be expedient, and they're going to be effective, and we can get through difficult points, that we can put a genuine, hard, boldface context to these stories about the ugliness, and you talk about 1915/1914 when this statue was constructed, that we were still fighting discrimination, mistreatment, maltreatment, oppression in our community, which continued all the way up through the 60s and likely, in many respects, in today's situation. My fear, by taking them down, putting them away, it's going to eliminate the opportunity for us to have those kinds of difficult conversations. I appreciate, if you don't mind, if Dr. Bliss would take a minute and talk about his perspective as it relates to both the first group and then the second.

CM CARLUCCI

I would be happy to, let me just say one thing. My bill was not putting away never to be put up again. My bill takes them down until the proper environment off public property can be found. And I would love to hear from Dr. Bliss about, you know, that time and what y'all put together in that first group. And I appreciate you sharing and talking about it. One other thing I do want to say, Mr. Boylan. Really, in a way, people say we're erasing history if we remove these monuments. I'm saying...

CM BOYLAN

[indecipherable] with all due respect [indecipherable].

CM CARLUCCI

Yes, go ahead.

BLISS

Well, first of all, thank you very much for the opportunity to come. Thanks very much for the opportunity to comment. Thanks for the opportunity to comment. Alan Bliss. And I shall make sure to make it clear that I am—even though I hold the position of CEO of the Jacksonville Historical Society—I am speaking now as a citizen and a subject matter expert and someone who, as Councilmember Boylan mentioned, participated in both the City Council's special task force in 2018 on Jacksonville Civil Rights History and also on the informal working group on the subject of Confederate memorials in Jacksonville that was convened by the Office of the Mayor in 2020. And we met for six months during the pandemic. We conducted our meetings via zoom. That was in a group of, a diverse group in terms of specialized background and perspective. There were artists and art historians, historians, such as myself, cultural specialists.

We had two advantages in holding the conversations that we did. One of them was that we were operating without having to... without the distraction of people holding extremely strong views on each side of this general question. And so, we kind of operated in a relatively peaceful conversational





## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

environment. And second, we all trusted each other even though we did not agree with each other, but we had confidence in each other's good intentions, and were willing to hear each other out with patients and from the assumption everybody was well intended. And I'm happy to comment on that process that CM, but Boylan referenced before I do that, let me address an area of discussion a few minutes back that both Council members referred to.

The Women of the Southland memorial was placed in Springfield Park, then known as Confederate Park, in 1914. That was, indeed during an era of racial terror lynching in Jacksonville. The Jacksonville Community Remembrance Project, which is a Duval County affiliate of the Equal Justice Initiative and a museum in Alabama. Jacksonville's Community Remembrance Project identified six incidents of racial terror lynchings in Jacksonville with eight victims. Two of the lynchings actually included two victims. So, the earliest of those took place in 1909. The most recent of them took place in 1945. And as faithful to the general part of what we know nationwide about racial terror lynchings that took place. And it's worth noting that those were not confined just to the states of the former Confederacy, but racial terror lynchings took place in states that were formally part of the union as far north as Indiana and Ohio, and in states of the American West.

The period during which those lynchings took place was indeed characterized by a great deal of racial tension across American culture wasn't confined just racial animosities but also a strong anti-immigration sentiment. A rising tide of suspicion of anybody who espoused points of view off the center of older socio-economic points or views that seem to be out of the mainstream. That was it was a time of great anxiety about modernization, technological change, and skepticism about scientific education in public schools. It was the time of the Scopes Monkey Trial, if you remember anything about that aspect of history. The 1910s and the 1920s are one of the most fascinating eras of American history.

Back to the working group and its conclusions and its discussions, and that's a matter of public record. So, I don't have to say a great deal, but I will say this: we focused in that group on two principal artifacts of Confederate memorialization in Jacksonville, and we chose to really not dwell on the items that were, and remain, in the Jacksonville City Cemetery, often called the Old City Cemetery. We just didn't think it was an area that we really ought to concern ourselves with. Cemeteries are kind of a special territory. But the memorial in Springfield Park, formerly known as Confederate Park, is known as the Monument to the Women of the Southland. We also discussed the remnant of the old Hemming statue in what's now known as James Johnson park, that column there.

The City Council really has four options available to it in dealing with this, and that is (1) to leave the memorials unchanged and exactly as they stand. The working group did not consider that to be a sustainable option and we devoted little discussion to it. The second alternative is (2) demolition of



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

those two artifacts, those two monuments, and even though there are some voices that are pretty firmly advocating for demolition, there are some arguments to be made against that. Among them is the artistic value and significance of the monuments, particularly the monument to The Women of the Southland in Springfield Park. Speaking for myself, I am not someone that you want making decisions about art, so I'm hard pressed to make a comment about the artistic significance of that. But people who are specialists in that area do make a robust case in favor of preservation in some form of those monuments and especially the one Springfield Park. The third alternative is (3) removal to a different location and the fourth alternative is (4) some form of recontextualization.

The third alternative of removal came in for a considerable amount of discussion. And where we finally ran aground on that was that no one could identify a destination site to which the monument might be removed where it would not continue to be a focus of some controversy. The choices come down to two, if removal is the option under discussion. And the first choice is (1) private property. The second one is (2) public property. And as Councilmember Boylan noted, it was the strong recommendation of the working group that no public money be invested in relocating the memorial to private property. The concern is that the City would at some point, somehow, have to choose a destination site and when and how that process would happen, and what sort of destination site might be acceptable in the eyes of the constituencies, was just beyond our scope to identify. Some voices in the working group were deeply sensitive to the possibility that the memorial might turn into some sort of a continuing [indecipherable] of the Confederacy and that it might still be conducted and then [indecipherable] would be [indecipherable] of city support in that the city endorsed or allowed or facilitated that.

So, we could not solve that problem and we finally moved on to the alternative of recontextualization, and as the report indicates, that was the bottom-line recommendation on which everybody signed off at the end of the process. And as Councilmember Carlucci and others have heard me say before, I think most of us on that working group signed off on that with some reluctance and some unease mainly because we saw it as the least objectionable of the options to the largest number of participants in the conversation. And the other reason for some reluctance and some concern was that we hadn't really come up with any actionable recommendation about exactly how that recontextualization would be framed. I can say this—and I'm speaking again here just for myself—but any recontextualization, if that's the direction that the Council opts to go with, it would have to be unflinching in its truthfulness and honesty about the background and the history this memorial represents.

And finally, let me explain the difference between "history" and "the past." The past is what happened. The past is the facts of the things that we can document, that we know, that we have and can find evidence in support. History is how we understand and explain the evidence and the people and events of the past. And it is the job of history to be faithful to the evidence, to place the actions of the people in



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

the past in context and to explain them again in a way that is as faithful as possible to our understanding of all of them. That's why history continues to evolve and change because the objects and long historical reach of the people and events of the past is continuing to unfold and continuing to change. We better understand the events and the decisions of a Presidency, for example, 50 years after that Presidency has ended than we did six months after it ended. Understanding changes continually over time.

And I harken back to one last thing, to the extended discussions of the Civil Rights Task Force had in 2018, and that's the group that was appointed by the City Council. And that was a group of, golly, I think more than 20 participants, and we did the in the sunshine and we heard plenty of comment and input from a variety of participants and outside observers during the course of that exercise. But one of the things that emerged was the fact that Civil Rights tourism has, in fact, ironically become an engine of economic development in the cities of the former Confederacy, where some of the most violent and memorable conflicts of the 1950s and 1960s occurred, during those climactic years of America's Civil Rights Movement. Those sites, those venues, and the artifacts of those conflicts have become sites of visitation and have actually come to be embraced and promoted by local tourism groups and Chambers of Commerce, in cities where those things took place. I often tell my students that if you're going to be a story, you really have to develop an appetite for irony. And that's one of the great ironies, I guess, of that aspect of the history and of civil rights and social injustice.

So, I hope some of those comments have been useful.

CM Boylan

Thank you, Dr. Bliss. CM Carlucci, for my last statement, really, are the three words that he used, that I said, I stand behind completely, in terms of our past: faithful, forthright, and unflinching. And I think that's where we have to go in this process. I want to make certain five we use these statues, this monument, as a vehicle to allow us to do that. Thank you.

CM CARLUCCI

I appreciate that, Mr. Boylan. Sorry, I had to interrupt you a little bit there. I did want to make a point that I've been accused of "erasing" history. Monuments that were put up, those are erasing history because they aren't actually monuments by the Confederacy that are erased, they used those, but they're trying to erase what the real history was, in trying to promote the Lost Cause and that slavery had nothing to do with the Civil War. So, they erected the Confederate monuments, and in a way, it took the focus off the real reason [for the war]. Would that be correct, Dr. Bliss?

BLISS

Can you restate the assertion?



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

CM CARLUCCI

The assertion is that they put up Confederate monuments to glorify a lost cause, and they were, in fact, somewhat erasing [history], as I read in this Mitch Landrieu book here. The fact that they were trying to promote the noble cause of the Lost Cause, 50 years later, and to say to the world, in a way, that we don't think this is about race. We don't think this is about slavery. And they were Jim Crow monuments.

BLISS

There's... I think I see what you're trying to assert there. And it certainly is true that there is a lot of evidence that memorials, such as this ONE, THE Women of the Confederacy, were placed at a moment when there was (1) a lot of sentiment directed toward veneration of the generation of Americans who fought in the Civil War, and that sentiment was true in the north and in the south. And I get that. And it also is true that the monument was placed (2) at a time of the rising assertions of white racial supremacy and legal institutionalized suppression of the civil rights of people of color.

We are careful, in the history business, we're careful about presuming to see too far inside the hearts of people in the past. We do the best we can to understand what they did and why they did it in the moment, but I am mindful, and I think most of my colleagues in the in the discipline of history would agree, that we're mindful that it's sometimes it's hard enough to see inside the hearts of our contemporaries in the living with a moment of the present. And so, we're cautious about asserting good or evil motives to people's actions in the past. Sometimes you find both present in the same person.

CM CARLUCCI

But they were erected at a time that we can document actions.

BLISS

Oh, certainly.

CM CARLUCCI

Okay. Now, I don't believe in recontextualization. So, I want to ask you a question: just how easy will it be and how much difficulty will it be? And how much acceptance will there be by some people, if they're telling you the actual truth, in the recontextualization?

BLISS

If it was easy, the working group, when we had a crack at, we would have done it when working on our report, I think.

CM CARLUCCI



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

Will it be painful?

BLISS

Yeah, it wouldn't be easy.

CM CARLUCCI

It would not be. Okay, anybody else here that would like to ask a question. I've done enough talking, and, Mike, if you'd like to talk more.

CM BOYLAN

Yeah, I do appreciate what, again, we're forming around this process. We do agree on a lot of things, and I do agree with you about the rationale as to why they were built. And where we differ, frankly, is how we make use of those facts at this point.

CM CARLUCCI

Well, let me just, I guess, finish by saying about the monuments... if you want a good read, read this book [holds up book]. In the Shadow of Statues by Mitch Landrieu, who was the mayor of New Orleans, and the issue of the statues and taking them down started somewhat after your conversations. More like in 2012 to 2016. And it is because of the hurt and the pain. And race relations improved a step at a time, and you certainly have done your fair share of taking positive steps toward that end. But there's more positive steps that must be taken. And so, I think recontextualization, I guess that's where we differ. But with that said, we'll have public comment, and so, John, you're up. Are you ready to speak?

NOONEY

My name is John Nooney, and my name is on the roster. Thanks for the opportunity to speak and you know, it was just really just dumb luck that I made it here. The Council calendar is showing here a special committee on Parks. So, you know, with the monuments, and let me just go back to college about 2013 384 And that was legislation was 10 years. They had to do it the armory Confederacy and zero access and during the public hearing and I met with him I asked him you're getting this big piece of property for three years. You have any problem for Joe Do you have access to the water as I've already named it, can you put that in, offered an amendment or something or ultimately government. So the point I'm going with and you alluded to it our understanding now we have civil rights towards well, your mother's eco-tourism. There's all kinds of tourism. But with the Mayans now, I don't believe we're in farming. But I understand that we just did the armory thing again and gave it to another group with two tenure options. And again, exert access to the water away from the screen. And another doctor listen, I'm sorry he's left already. But you know the casket factory, again, access where we are giving away all this taxpayer dollars. But the public is getting wrong when it comes to our water, just literally crushed and



## OFFICE OF THE CITY COUNCIL

**MATT CARLUCCI, SR.**  
COUNCIL MEMBER AT-LARGE, GROUP 4  
OFFICE (904) 255-5218  
ECA (904) 255-5159  
E-MAIL: mcarlucci@coj.net

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE 425  
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL  
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

another piece of legislation we just passed was 2022 319 and we just gave 100 feet of access to was there even a sliver 25 Are you like talking about developer got a launch but we just interviewed million. So anyway, that was Fowler as online. And you know, it's as far as the issue? Yes, often will. But you know, you're gonna all of a sudden create this one tourism scenario. Memphis same time. Absolutely. Rubbish. And not. So anyway, we just want to share that with the public that will save lives here.

CM CARLUCCI

Ok, thank you. Are there any other members of the public here? CM Boylan, I think it is your duty to thank everybody and dismiss the meeting.

CM BOYLAN

Thank you, everybody. This meeting is dismissed.

Transcribed by <https://otter.ai>

### **Meeting Adjourned: 12:52 PM**

Minutes: Prepared by Sheri Webber, Executive Council Assistant – At-Large, Group 4, 904-255-5159, [swebber@coj.net](mailto:swebber@coj.net)

The written minutes for this meeting are an approximation of what was discussed and are not legally binding. This meeting was streamed live through the City Council website and a video is archived there (see link, page 1). Remarks were transcribed by A.I. and may not be verbatim.