



**OFFICE OF THE CITY
COUNCIL**

RANDY DEFOOR
COUNCIL MEMBER, DISTRICT 14
PHONE (904) 255-5214
FAX (904) 255-5230
EMAIL: RDEFOOR@COJ.NET

117 WEST DUVAL STREET, SUITE
425
4TH FLOOR, CITY HALL
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32202

Minutes

Noticed Meeting with Council Member DeFoor District 14 Town Hall

Thursday, March 31, 2021, 6:00 p.m.

Virtual

Attendance: Council Member Randy DeFoor, Florida State Representative Angie Nixon for District 14, Dr. Joshua Gellers- Murray Hill Preservation Association Board Member, Stacy Watson May- Attorney, Gage Miller- Senior Environmental Scientist with Golder Associates , John Otterson- IFF, Michael Munz- Company spokesperson, Attorney Kealey West, Assistant Director James Maher- Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Northeast District, Christopher Teaf, Ph.D., Florida State University Institute for Science & Public Affairs, Michelle Worley- District Executive Secretary II, District 14 for Representative Nixon, Executive Council Assistant Brooks Dame for Council Member DeFoor.

Meeting Convened: 6:00 p.m.

Council Member Randy DeFoor

Council Member DeFoor welcomed and thanked the public and agencies for attending. Council Member DeFoor outlined the meeting protocol and zoom features for public comment.

Florida State Representative Angie Nixon, Dist. 14

Representative Angie Nixon expressed it was important to her to be accountable to the public. She reported she would be working with Council Member DeFoor on this issue.

Summary of constituent experience - Murray Hill Preservation Association Board Member, Dr. Joshua Gellers

Dr. Gellers thanked Council Member DeFoor and Representative Nixon. He reported the residents were suffering due to the noxious, suffocating odor present in the early morning and late evening when City inspectors are often not able to attend. Dr. Gellers noted he received dozens of complaints in his role as a member of the Murray Hill Preservation Association Board, which included shortness of breath, burning sensations, nausea, and asthma attacks. He expressed his support for the City Council purchasing Envirosuite to assist with gathering scientific data.

International Flavors & Fragrances

Company Spokesperson Michael Munz thanked Council Member DeFoor and Representative Nixon. He confirmed he would be available for follow up questions. Attorney Stacy May announced International Flavors & Fragrances (IFF) has a 'Contact Us' page, recently created, for the Jacksonville Plant on the

website. Ms. May confirmed IFF hired Golder Associates to identify odor and to determine if IFF was responsible. She reaffirmed IFF's willingness to be a good community member and to operate with integrity. Ms. May reported there are other industrial facilities in the area. The IFF facility is in constant production 365 days a year. Mr. John Otterson, Senior Environmental Scientist, confirmed the plant was preventing odor from leaving IFF on the production side through state of the art engineering and processing. The windblown odor prevention is a vapor collection system, a scrubber on the boiler system, and recently IFF has directed efforts to waste water treatment by using a fog elimination system and a floating hexagonal disk shield system.

Ms. May and Mr. Miller shared a presentation showing the wind direction on December 28th, 2020, a day when odor complaints were received. Mr. Miller confirmed IFF was in compliance with their air permits and that there were no findings to support a health risk from any odor associated with IFF, who was not likely to be the source in the Murray Hill Odor. Mr. Miller confirmed he collect samples of air in the early mornings which were analyzed by a lab. They did air dispersion modeling that did not reveal any odor issues. He sampled for sulfur and turpentine downwind of IFF and other potential companies. He confirmed samples did not capture any trace of either compound. For styrene (sweet, rubber odor) monitoring, Mr. Miller found it was detected south of Beaver Street. He reported IFF does not use styrene. He concluded that two facilities, Reichhold Inc. and Taylor Made, do.

Council Member DeFoor inquired if any other compounds were found. She requested to see the sample information. Ms. May confirmed sulfur and turpentine were not detected and the styrene was detected at 1.5-25 parts per billion.

Mr. Miller reported some odors smell pleasant a lower concentration but at high concentration they become an irritant. Ms. May confirmed IFF was not using styrene but were investigating other facilities, for example, American Coolair Corps, who reported on their Facebook page a process that IFF knows to make a foul odor. Ms. May reported American Coolair does not have an air permit and that there is also a JEA lift station nearby. Ms. Miller suggested that if someone smelled something in the area it would be challenging for anyone using their nose to differentiate what odors they are detecting.

Environmental Quality Division, City of Jacksonville – Attorney Kealey West

Ms. Kealey West outlined the City's Odor Ordinance, the reporting, and investigating processes. The Ordinance regulates objectionable odors that result in a public nuisance. The City's EQD investigates the numerous order complaints in the City. Once a complaint is filed EQD staff investigates and notifies the source of the odor. To move to Enforcement the City must verify complaints from 5 persons within a 90 day period. The city would then work with the source or sources to mitigate. EQD Staff has notified, that entity works with the city to conduct leak checks and other necessary actions to minimize odor.

She confirmed odors smelled should be reported to 630-City as soon as possible. All odor complaints received by the City are provided to EQD. In regards to IFF, there was a citation issued and there is an ongoing enforcement. Dates in citation are not within the timeframe of the modeling or the sampling. Earlier this month the Environmental Protection Board approved funding for a 12 month odor study intended to provide EQD and the general public with a better understanding of how odor moves

through Jacksonville. The study will allow for 24 hours a day monitoring 7 days a week. It will next go through City Council for appropriations and may begin, if approved, this summer.

Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Northeast District – Assistant Director James Maher

Mr. Jim Maher introduced himself and reported the departments mission was to protect conserve and manage the state's natural resources and enforce environmental laws. He noted many of the complaints reference health concerns. Mr. Maher welcomed the public and their participation with this odor issue. He noted the DEP does have a title 5 air permit with IFF which has a number of emission units which are measured a submitted in semiannual and annual reports. IFF has been in compliance. From 2012- 2019 his office has responded 16 times and have been unable to validate any odor.

Public Comment

Ms. Jenny Lee Wright reported she experienced an odor at home, has driven past IFF, and confirmed the objectionable odor was the same. She asked how many turpentine samples were collect, across how many days, and if there was another chemical possibly making this smell. Mr. Miller explained he conducted 4 samples at IFF in 1 day, 1 upwind and 2 downwind. Turpentine was only sampled on 1 day and it was detected at the fence line. Ms. May confirmed 1 day of sampling for each compound and 2 days for styrene.

Dr. Allison Cato reported she was concerned about styrene as a carcinogen. She requested the City conduct an independent investigation. Ms. West responded an air study would sample for odor and compounds.

Ms. Bambi Johnston stated she lives on the east side of the river and has experienced multiple odor issues on early morning runs.

Dr. Angela Mann reported she has been held hostage at home during her pregnancy due to this odor. She mentioned she was offended by the presentation that suggested they were not culpable. She inquired how inversion was factored into the Golder study and how sample locations were determined. Dr. Mann reported she supported the Envirosuite program. Ms. May reported the stacks at IFF have limits to what can come out and that IFF was within the allowable amounts. Mr. Miller confirmed the modeling did take weather conditions.

Mr. JA Hobson stated he has spoken to IFF employees and Symrise employees have confirmed they are aware of an odor issue. He reported the City does not respond in a timely manner and noted odor is caused by expulsion of waste water as spent turpentine by products.

Ms. Lisa Crawford reported she cannot tolerate the odor. She inquired if there was a mechanism locals could use to capture a sample. She added her experience as a weather specialist tin the airforce led her to believe it is worse when there is a higher humidity count.

Ms. Liz Landis reported witnessing a fog with the odor. She inquired why the chemical smell would create a fog. Mr. Maher responded it was not typical to see a fog from styrene or turpentine.

Mr. Grant Cooper from Fishweir Creek reported the odor was so strong that it prevented them from being outside. He picked up notes of garbage, pin sol, and turpentine. Mr. Cooper shared his support for Envirosuite. Mr. Maher responded he could be reached at 256-1700 for odor concerns and emphasizes the City should also receive the report.

Mr. Shane Brisentine reported the odor has increased drastically in 2019. He expressed his disappointment that the City had not cited IFF until December.

Council Member DeFoor asked if IFF knew when samples were being taken. Mr. Miller answered in the affirmative. Council Member DeFoor asked if discharge into the pond happened 24/7, Mr. Otterson answered in the affirmative. Ms. May noted that one of the facilities on Beaver Street who began operation in August 2020 after being cited twice in 2019 for styrene odor and when they signed consent order they agreed to find a new location with higher stacks. Ms. West confirmed that facility had been investigated for odor complaints.

Mr. Kevin Wyatt expressed frustration about lack of response and communication on this issue. He added the odor was causing financial harm.

Mr. Stephen Turner casted doubt on the data and assessment provided by Golden Associates.

Ms. Candace reported offensive odor stretched beyond Murray Hill, confirmed she had tracked a chemical cloud to IFF and stated the odor was causing her family headaches and limiting enjoyment of the neighborhood.

Dr. Joshua Gellers inquired about permit regulated by DEP's and what DEP had done. Mr. Maher reported his office had investigated 16 times and had been unable to validate or verify odor complaints. He noted the City had a more robust complaint investigation due to ordinance on public nuisance. DEP was focused on emissions units and a broad general prohibition against object able odor. Until October 2020 the DEP did not have the volume or indication of the intensity the DEP could verify that would trip the threshold.

Christopher Teaf, Ph.D., Florida State University Institute for Science & Public Affairs

Dr. Teaf shared his support for a thorough study.

Council Member DeFoor thanked the agencies, neighbors, and IFF for attending tonight. She thanked neighbors for sharing their experiences. She confirmed this has to be resolved.

Meeting Adjourned: 7:59 PM

Minutes prepared by Brooks Dame, Executive Council Assistant to Council Member Randy DeFoor. The following items were submitted for public record and can be accessed by contacting the Legislative Services Division: minutes, agenda, handout Table of Partners, and handout Frequently Asked Questions, and handout IFF Presentation.